

The Poverty of Smart Meters

Consumers Pay Up: Industry Cashes In



National Utility & Energy Affordability Conference
June 15, 2010 • San Antonio, Texas
Mark W. Toney, Ph.D., TURN Executive Director
mtoney@turn.org • 510 590 2862

Massive Consumer Complaints

- **Consumers have been complaining for three years.**
 - Lois Henry of Bakersfield Californian.
- **State Senator Dean Florez Public Hearings.**
 - 300 Bakersfield residents testified for 5 hours.
 - 200 Fresno residents testified for 4 1/2 hours.
- **Thousands of Complaints: CPUC, TURN, etc.**
 - Usage and bills that doubled or tripled.
 - Fires, shorted out appliances, interference with systems.

Smart Meter Testimonial #3

Since the installation of a Smart Meter, my electric usage is being read at double the amount compared to last year. There is no reason for an increase of usage. All of my major appliances are less than 10 years old and are labelled energy star rated.

My current bill is 748 Kwh, last year was 359Kwh. If PG&E insists that the meters are accurate, am I to believe that for the last 28 years, they've been inaccurate?

Smart Meter Billing Dispute #1

Bill Date	kWh	Elec Bill
5/07/09	442	\$53.82
6/07/09	859	\$117.95
7/07/09	926	\$131.95
8/06/09	1,250	\$230.94
9/06/09	113	\$572.12
10/06/09	865	\$112.36

Why did September bill double when usage dropped by 90%?



Smart Meter Blows Up at Business

– ABC TV 23 in Bakersfield, Mark Christian reporting.

On Wednesday, a PG&E technician was called out to replace the meter after employees found the device burned up and lying on the ground and the face plate was blown off and the whole meter was blackened. PG&E technician ... had replaced at least 15 meters around town due to the same problem.

Consumer Smart Meter Revolt



PG&E: Out of Touch & Control

- **We are 100% right—Our customers are 100% wrong.**
 - Alibi #1: Hot weather, rate hikes, inclining tier rates.
 - Alibi #2: Smart Meters have tested as 100% accurate.
 - Alibi #3: The old meters ran slow.
- **Senate Majority Leader Dean Florez got results.**
 - Pressured CPUC to launch Independent Investigation.
 - Appointed to Utilities Cmt & Chair of Smart Grid Cmt.
 - PG&E Records: 23,000 improperly installed, 11,400 failed to retain consumer usage data, 9,000 trouble connecting to wireless network.
- **PG&E response: Full steam ahead!**
 - Continues to install 15,000 meters a day.
 - Plans to hire 100 new customer service reps.
 - Continues to burn bridges: CCA's and Prop 16.

Opposition to PG&E Smart Meters

- **Thousands of customer complaints about unexplainable high bills, fires, interference.**
 - **Counties of Sonoma, San Francisco, and Santa Clara have passed resolutions calling for a moratorium on Smart Meter installation until CPUC independent investigation is done.**
 - **Increasing media coverage of individuals across Northern California refusing installation of smart meters.**
 - **Neighborhoods are declaring Smart Meter Free Zones.**

Smart Meters & Dynamic Pricing

- **Peak Load Shifting: Alternatives to Dynamic Pricing.**
 - Dangers to residents unable to shift usage: elderly, infants.
 - Air conditioning cycling provides instant peak reduction.
 - Sending out public announcement alerts are effective.
- **Reduction of Energy Consumption.**
 - Power strips, clotheslines, weatherization.
 - Structural changes are more effective than behavioral.
- **Do people act in their economic self-interest?**
 - Why are so many people broke and in debt?
 - Who has the time...tech savvy...language/math skills?
 - Curbside recycling: Community v. economic approach.

Smart Meters as Consumer Benefit

- **Address Challenges to Smart Meters**
 - Data privacy and smart grid security concerns.
 - Address concerns raised by EMF activists.
 - Investigate and resolve consumer complaints.
- **Maximize Tangible Consumer Benefits.**
 - Minimize the cost of smart meters.
 - Expedite real time pricing data for interested customers.
 - Minimize consumer harm—i.e., increased disconnects.
 - View customer satisfaction as essential to deployment.

Big Brother is Watching

- **Collection of Highly Individualized Data.**
 - Specific appliance use through energy signatures.
 - Living habits, waking, sleeping, away from home.
- **Access to Individual Household Records.**
 - Ownership of data: Customers or Utility?
 - Restrictions on sale or release to commercial interests.
 - Restrictions on release to law enforcement.
- **Cyber Security of Individual Data Records.**
 - Security of 900 MHz broadcast of data from chips.
 - 179,000 records stolen in Toronto in July 2009.

Smart Meters & EMF Concerns

- **Concerns about health effects are expanding.**
 - While TURN is skeptical about EMF health claims, we are not health experts and do not know about health risks.
 - However, at least one-third of 30 weekly smart meter callers to TURN express concern about the EMF issue.
- **PG&E must address EMF health concerns.**
 - EMF advocates tend to be upper middle class, highly educated, white, high propensity voters.
 - PG&E could form an advisory/research committee with EMF activists.

Minimize Cost/Harm to Ratepayers



- **Profits Before Customers is a Problem.**
 - 12% authorized rate of return.
 - \$2.2 billion approved ratepayer funding for PG&E
 - PG&E wants profits on replaced old meters as well.
- **Prohibit Remote Shutoffs as Collection Weapon.**
 - 75% increase in PG&E shut offs of low-income households documented by Division of Ratepayer Advocates.

Gaining Customer Support

- **Minimize the Cost of Smart Meter Deployment.**
 - Zero cost for smart meters deployment for ratepayers of Sacramento Municipal Utility District.
 - Annual cost of paying debt on bonds is covered by operational cost savings.
- **Prioritize customer satisfaction.**
 - Expedite real time pricing data for interested customers.
 - Minimize installs during the summer like SMUD to avoid PG&E Bakersfield firestorm of complaints.
 - 50,000 smart meters installed in SMUD.
 - Customer satisfaction at 94.7%
 - Smart meter high bill calls are identical to old meter high bill calls.

Rebuilding Consumer Confidence

- **Moratorium until the Investigation is Complete.**
 - Investigation announced in October—done by March.
 - Only thing expedited is pace of smart meter installation.
- **Minimize ratepayer cost of smart meters.**
 - The greater the cost, the more years consumers must wait to see benefits—while utility benefits are immediate.
 - Consumers want their money's worth.
- **Solicit more community input in policymaking.**
 - CPUC should sponsor hearings statewide to solicit ratepayer input into smart meter policies.